

**THE PRESIDIO TRUST
BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

**RESOLUTION 14-22
PRESIDIO TRUST ART COLLECTIONS ACQUISITION –
EARTH WALL BY ANDY GOLDSWORTHY**

WHEREAS, [16 U.S.C. §460bb appendix](#) authorizes the Presidio Trust to manage, maintain and improve the property within the Presidio of San Francisco under its administrative jurisdiction; and

WHEREAS, the Board of Directors adopted an [Art Policy](#) and a [Presidio Trust Art Collections Manual](#) (“Manual”) consistent with and pursuant to the Art Policy; and

WHEREAS, the Manual outlines a review process for objects that may be acquired by the Presidio Trust (“Acquisition Procedure”); and

WHEREAS, the Acquisition Procedure requires the Presidio Trust to review potential acquisitions under applicable environmental and historic preservation compliance processes; and

WHEREAS, the Acquisition Procedure requires the Presidio Trust Executive Director to create an Art Review Panel (“Panel”) to review potential acquisitions and forward its recommendations to the Executive Director; and

WHEREAS, the Acquisition Procedure requires the Executive Director to forward the Panel’s comments, as may be supplemented by his own, to the Board of Directors for a final decision; and

WHEREAS, the site-specific work, *Earth Wall* by Andy Goldsworthy, proposed to be installed in the courtyard of the Officers’ Club was reviewed under applicable environmental and historic compliance law, and received a categorical exclusion and was found to have no adverse effect on the building in which the work will be installed or on the Presidio’s National Historic Landmark District status; and

WHEREAS, the Panel reviewed *Earth Wall* by Andy Goldsworthy consistent with the Manual, as outlined in the [attached comments](#), and recommends its acquisition and installation;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Presidio Trust Board of Directors hereby approves the acquisition and installation in the courtyard of the Officers’ Club of *Earth Wall* by Andy Goldsworthy.

Adopted: July 16, 2014

ART REVIEW PANEL

Proposed Art Installation by Andy Goldsworthy - Presidio Officers' Club Courtyard

Participants

Diane Frankel, The Museum Group (*see attached bio*)

Hesse McGraw, San Francisco Art Institute (*see attached bio*)

John Pelka, Presidio Trust NEPA Compliance Manager

Michelle Taylor, Historic Compliance Coordinator (designee of Presidio Trust Deputy Federal Preservation Officer)

Allison Stone, Presidio Trust Associate Director, Trails & Philanthropic Projects

Background

On Thursday July 10, 2014 the Presidio Trust convened a review panel comprised of two outside art professionals and Trust staff. The purpose of the panel was to evaluate a new art installation proposed by artist Andy Goldsworthy in the courtyard area at the Presidio Officers' Club. The review was conducted in accordance with the Trust's *Art Policy* and *Art Collections Manual*. The conclusions and recommendation of the panel will be provided to the Presidio Trust Board of Directors along with relevant compliance (NEPA and NHPA) conclusions, and supplemental comments from the Trust Executive Director, as part of their decision-making process.

MEETING NOTES

Site Walk

The panel review began with a site walk of the proposed location of the new artwork in the Presidio Officers' Club. A brief tour of the facility and surroundings was provided for contextual understanding of the setting, followed by a review of the proposed installation site. The group discussed the scale, placement, materials, surroundings, etc. at the site and then convened a discussion of the work.

Panel Discussion

Allison Stone provided an overview of the *Art Policy* and the criteria for acquisition identified in the *Art Collections Manual*. Michelle Taylor gave background on the historic and environmental compliance process completed to date for the project.

The focal point of the panel discussion was on the *Criteria for Acquisition* listed below. The criteria were reviewed and discussed in this order – and a chronological overview of the panel comments follows.

1. Objects must be excellent examples of their kind;
2. Objects must enhance the visitor experience; and
3. Objects must be appropriate for exhibition in a public place.

Diane Frankel opened the discussion by noting that Andy Goldsworthy is a world-renowned artist, and that his approach to art mirrors the “integrity” of the work being done to rehabilitate the building and throughout the Presidio. She noted that because the Trust has worked with the artist before, there is implicit trust in his ability to deliver on the promise of his proposal. She noted that while the work is considered “permanent,” it has a quality of decay that is intrinsic to the Presidio’s other art work.

Hesse McGraw noted the importance of having deep engagement from an artist at a site. Having done multiple works in the park allows the development of a sense of purpose and understanding of the materiality of place. It allows the creation of iconic things that represent the place over time. Too often public art collections do not afford this type of deep conversation and as a result feel disparate.

John Pelka inquired as to whether it is possible to reach a saturation point with a particular artist – and whether we are there with Andy Goldsworthy.

Hesse McGraw stated that it is possible but that he does not think we are there with Andy Goldsworthy. Diane Frankel offered that there is now a sufficient number to provide a hike experience – that each piece is diverse, affording visitors a satisfying understanding of the both the artist and place.

Hesse McGraw noted that the proposed artwork creates a restful terminus – a contemplative place within the courtyard. He notes that Andy Goldsworthy did not choose “an obvious place” to locate the piece. It is a site that may have been architecturally overlooked, but nonetheless a critical spot in building circulation – located along a primary entrance/exit. The art work will grant more importance to this space – creating “a moment.”

John Pelka referenced the DeYoung courtyard as an analogue – it creates a sense of entrance and subtly but powerfully references the temporary nature of San Francisco (based on its seismic setting).

Hesse McGraw noted that the proposal will bring some gravitas to the site. Its relationship to nature – backdrop of the forest creates an opportunity to pause and think about the location. It is more than “appropriate” for the setting.

Diane Frankel noted that while some other artists think about site in their work – Andy Goldsworthy brings a “site-specific genius” to his works. It is appropriate for the site in ways that may not be readily apparent to the lay person.

Hesse McGraw said that in many ways the artwork may make the site more public – creating a different kind of personal or social moment. Diane Frankel agreed, adding that it will likely become a magnet – creating a draw to place as well as to other activities within the building and vice versa.

Diane Frankel concluded that it is appropriate, interesting and beautifully thought out. Hesse McGraw added that it is not a static work – it will be vibrating with real energy.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION

The panel concluded that the proposed work meets the *Criteria for Acquisition* as outlined in the *Art Collections Manual*. It provides an excellent example of a site-specific artwork from a world renowned artist. It will enhance the visitor experience and will create a new a moment and focal point within the Officers' Club. The panel recommends the acquisition and installation of the proposed Andy Goldsworthy art piece.

ART PANEL BIOGRAPHIES

Diane Frankel, The Museum Group

Diane Frankel has twenty-five years of experience in the non-profit arena, serving as the director of [graduate programs](#) in museum studies at John F. Kennedy University and the founding director of the Bay Area Discovery Museum. As a presidential appointee of President Clinton, she headed the Institute of Museum and Library Services in Washington, DC. This agency provides funds for museum and libraries across the United States and is the largest Federal cultural agency.

Upon her return to San Francisco, Ms. Frankel directed the Children, Youth and Families [Program](#) at the James Irvine Foundation. Since leaving the Foundation in 2004, she has been the Interim Director at the di Rosa Preserve, has served as a consultant to arts and cultural organizations, as an affiliate of Management Consultants for the Arts, and as the Executive Director of the Artists' Legacy Foundation. Ms. Frankel enjoys working with museums as they transition from one director to another, on their strategic planning process and fund raising programs.

Ms. Frankel is a graduate of the University of California at Berkeley. She received her Master of Arts and Teaching from George Washington University. She attended the Getty Museum Management Institute and the Harvard University Kennedy School of Public Policy summer program for senior government officials.

Ms. Frankel has been active in volunteer activities and has served on numerous boards. Most recently she was president of ArtTable (2003-2005) and currently serves on the San Francisco Art Institute Board of Trustees and the Alliance of Artists Communities Board of Trustees.

Hesse McGraw

Hesse McGraw is a curator and writer and is Vice President for Exhibitions and Public Programs at the San Francisco Art Institute. At SFAI he directs the Walter and McBean Galleries, and oversees SFAI's public programs, visiting artists series and public education programs for youths and adults. From 2008 to 2013 he served as chief curator at the Bemis Center for Contemporary Arts in Omaha, Nebraska, where he developed an exhibition program focused on site-specific, immersive, cross-disciplinary, and socially engaged projects. At the Bemis Center he produced two-dozen exhibitions, including major public projects with artists Theaster Gates and Michael Jones McKean.

Mr. McGraw was formerly associate director of Max Protetch gallery in New York, and was the founding director and curator of Paragraph, which operates under the non-profit Charlotte Street Foundation in Kansas City, Missouri. He lectures widely and his writing has recently been published in *Afterall*, *Art Papers*, *Outpost* and in diverse exhibition catalogues. Recent awards

and grants include an Andy Warhol Foundation Curatorial Research Fellowship, an ArtPlace America grant, a Robert Rauschenberg Foundation Artistic Innovation and Collaboration Grant, NEA Our Town and Art Works grants, and a Harpo Foundation grant.

Mr. McGraw lives in Berkeley, California with his wife and their two sons.